

**CALIFORNIA CITRUS PEST AND DISEASE PREVENTION PROGRAM COMMITTEE  
MEETING**

Meeting Minutes  
Wednesday, May 8, 2019

**Opening:**

The regular meeting of the California Citrus Pest and Disease Prevention Committee (CPDPC) was called to order at 10:00 a.m. on May 8, 2019 in Ventura, California by Committee Chairman Jim Gorden.

**CPDPC Members Present:**

Kevin Ball	John Gless	Mark McBroom	Kevin Severns
Ed Civerolo	Jim Gorden	George McEwen	Roger Smith
Aaron Dillon*	Ted Grether	James McFarlane	Brian Specht*
Bob Felts, Jr.	Nick Hill	Etienne Rabe	Keith Watkins

**CPDPC Members Absent:**

Craig Armstrong

**CDFA Staff:**

Jonathan Babineau*	Gavin Iacono*	Magally Luque-Williams*	Keith Okasaki*
Ryan Fong	Sara Khalid*	David Morgan*	Lea Pereira*
Victoria Hornbaker	Luci Kumagai*	Colleen Murphy-Vierra	Nawal Sharma
Cassandra Davis			

**Guests:**

Ameer Atrash*	Adam Francioni*	Leslie Leavens	Lisa Soury*
Jill Barnier*	Subhas Hajeri*	Joel Nelsen	Fred Strickland
Margie Bartells	Sara Garcia-Figuera*	Curtis Pate*	Sheila Tate
Teri Blaser	Jason Gless	Sylvie Robillard	Michelle Thom*
David Court	Zac Green*	Robert Roma*	Susan Watkins
Holly Deniston-Sheets	Melinda Klein	Jason Sapp*	Kirk Williams*
Rick Dunn	Catherine Keeling*	Jason Schwartze*	Judy Zaninovich*
Lisa Finke	John Krist	Cressida Silvers*	Sandra Zwaal*
Colin Flippen*	Debbie Larmon*		

\* Participated via Webinar

**Opening Comments:**

Jim Gorden welcomed the Committee, staff, and members of the public participating in person and online and stated that there was a quorum for the meeting. He acknowledged that the meeting was being held in compliance with the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act.

**Public Comments:**

Margie Bartells stated that she was dismayed at the lack of options for controlling Asian citrus psyllid (ACP) for organic growers. She stated that spraying pesticides for ACP does not allow a grower to sell fruit under an organic label that year and will eliminate organic

growers in Ventura County. She suggested that the California Department of Food and Agriculture (CDFA) has turned its back on organic growers with the area-wide treatment policies.

### **COMMITTEE BUSINESS & UPDATES**

Jim reviewed the consent agenda which contained minutes from the Committee meeting that took place on March 12, 2019.

**Motion:** To approve the consent agenda that included the March 12, 2019 Citrus Pest and Disease Prevention Committee (CPDPC) meeting minutes as presented.

First: Mark McBroom

Second: John Gless

Motion passes: All in favor

### **FINANCE COMMITTEE REPORT**

Bob Felts, Jr. stated that Fiscal Year (FY) 2017/18 has been closed out. Total expenditures for FY 17/18 were approximately \$8,000,000 under the proposed budget. The total revenue received in FY 17/18 was \$15,137,479. Comparing the total revenue received with the projected \$16,470,000, there was a shortfall of \$1,332,521. The total expenditures for FY 18/19 through April are \$9,700,000. Ryan Fong suggested that there is a six to seven month lag due to the difficulties with the new accounting system FI\$CAL. He expected to see December closed out by next month. Victoria stated that the budget line items do not perfectly line up with expenditures, and that Financial Services has not been able to track expenditures to the correct groups. Ray Leclerc has developed an expenditure tracking system and plans to implement the new coding system on July 1, 2019. Victoria explained that all state agencies must use FI\$CAL. It was noted that there are line items in the FY 18/19 budget that have been overspent for the year. Victoria noted that the Statewide Admin line includes Citrus staff and pro rata. The line for Southern California survey and PDEP trapping has more than traps on the Mexico border due to an inability to track to a greater level of detail. Bob stated that FY 18/19 revenue is \$10,322,409.97, which is \$7,700,000 short of the projected \$18,000,000. He stated that the Finance Subcommittee considered reducing the projection to account for dropped and abandoned fruit. Victoria stated the budget has an additional \$2,500,000 in Ag funds and a \$5,000,000 bump in spending authority.

Victoria explained that the budget change proposal to make the Citrus Pest and Disease Prevention program a stand-alone division was added to the Governor's budget, passing the Senate budget committee. She believed it would make it through the May revision and be in place July 1, 2019. CDFA is preparing to conduct interviews to hire field staff and transfer staff into the Citrus Division. Victoria noted that a reorganization package was submitted to California Department of Human Resources (Cal HR). Cal HR has three to six months to approve the package for the Division to be established. She explained that there will be no interruption of resources or services.

### **EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE REPORT**

Keith Watkins stated that four candidates were interviewed for the Branch Chief position in the Citrus Division. An offer is pending until the Department of Finance approves converting the position from Environmental Program Manager I (EPM) to EPM II. Etienne Rabe stated that in future, the Committee should have a way of tracking motions and revisiting them at the next meeting. On July 12, 2018, the CPDPC adopted a motion to phase out area-wide buffer treatments and devolve such activity to the local level, including Pest Control Districts (PCDs). He noted that the Committee has not received updates on executing this motion. It was suggested that the Committee set aside a section for open and unresolved old business.

### **Grower Response Task Force Meeting Recommendation**

Keith stated that the Task Force's goal is to approve a document with a series of voluntary grower responses under different scenarios where Huanglongbing (HLB) has been detected near or in commercial groves. He noted that once the document is approved by the Committee, Citrus Research Board (CRB) and Nuffer Smith Tucker (NST) will put on grower seminars to roll out the voluntary actions. He intends the voluntary grower response to be a living document that can be amended as new technologies become available. Price Adams explained that the task force was advised by the Data Analysis and Tactical Operations Cell (DATOC) and shared the document with the committee on April 29, 2019. She asked for comments and edits from the Committee, noting that the document will be edited and recirculated. Several Committee members recommended removing early detection technologies (EDTs), barriers and bactericides from the document.

## **OPERATIONS COMMITTEE REPORT**

### **Strategic Priority 1 – Find and Eradicate HLB**

#### **HLB Risk-based Survey Update and Orange County HLB Update**

Magally Luque-Williams stated that her team has completed risk survey in 984 Section Township Range (STR) grids and 53,195 sites have been surveyed. Risk survey has been completed in 13 of the 28 counties and is ongoing in Fresno, Kern, San Diego, Riverside, Los Angeles, San Bernardino, Ventura, Tulare, Orange, Placer, Yolo, Shasta, Butte, Humboldt and Sacramento. She noted that risk-based survey data is almost complete and that she will provide quarterly updates. It was requested that Magally focus on presenting maps of trends and directions of the disease rather than presenting the numbers of sites surveyed.

Magally gave an update on active 400-meter delimitations. She stated that her teams have responded to 293 HLB-positive trees in Anaheim with the survey 44 percent complete; 441 HLB-positive trees in Garden Grove with the survey 30 percent complete; 137 HLB-positive trees in Westminster with the survey 22 percent complete; 74 infected trees in Santa Ana with the survey 46 percent complete; and two HLB-positive trees in Huntington Beach with the survey 98 percent complete. She noted that her teams are behind on survey data for the delimitation survey. Total HLB detections are: 985 properties, 1,340 HLB-positive trees, and 232 *Candidatus Liberibacter asiaticus*-positive

ACP. She explained that during a delimitation survey, Magally's team has people in the center of the delimitation and then start work at the border of the delimitation zone. She noted that her team looks for any STRs within the high-risk survey; if the high-risk survey is complete she will send surveyors to STRs around the delimitation. Magally explained that 2,618 quadrant samples have been taken in Orange County so far this year. She stated that the spring HLB border survey is 66 percent complete in Imperial County and 59 percent complete in San Diego County.

### **Los Angeles HLB Update**

Tina Galindo stated that staff are performing delimitation surveys in Compton, El Monte, Temple City/Rosemead and the Pico Rivera expansion in Montebello, and resurveys in San Gabriel. She noted that her teams are now following up on no contacts. She explained that Los Angeles has 26 surveyors, this includes ten surveyors in Compton to meet heavy demand, six surveyors in high risk areas, four surveyors in San Gabriel and two surveyors in Montebello and Temple City and one surveyor each in La Puente and El Monte. She noted that three leads typically work on sample quality control but are currently spending half their time working on flush sampling and quadrant sampling. She noted that refusal rates in Compton may be as high as twenty percent compared to two percent in other areas, due to distrust of the government in that area.

Tina stated that the Montebello 1 area is complete, and her team is retreating the Pico Rivera area. She noted that Anaheim treatment area continues to grow. Garden Grove and Santa Ana are pending treatment, and Huntington Beach, Westminster, Rosemead/Temple City, La Puente, El Monte, Compton and Montebello are pending meetings.

Colleen Murphy-Vierra gave an update on the progress of the Situation Status (SitStat) report and interactive map. Confirming that the map will include visual representations of these in-progress areas. She explained that the SitStat map is still a work in progress and she is waiting on missing data.

Victoria gave an update on the progress of the Citrus Surveyor Application that CDFA is looking to develop. She noted that the Citrus Surveyor program will allow surveyors to enter information on a tree by tree basis. She stated that the Stage 1 business analysis of the Information Technology (IT) project approval life cycle is complete, with Stage 2 analysis in progress and a meeting with demos should occur in two weeks.

### **HLB Diagnostic Update**

Luci Kumagai stated that CDFA processed 7,907 plant samples, CRB processed 2,027 ACP samples and University of Arizona processed 806 ACP samples for a total of 10,740 samples in April. She explained that a total of 41,293 samples were tested in 2019. As of May 6, 2019, 1,340 HLB-positive trees were detected and removed; 350 from Los Angeles, 986 from Orange County, and 4 trees from Riverside. She noted that the two April hotspots are Montebello in Los Angeles County with 41 finds and Westminster in Orange County with 79 finds. She explained that 23 of the Westminster finds were located in one trailer park, with four HLB-positive finds in another nearby trailer park. The trees

located there have high bacterial titer. She explained that samples from both trailer parks will be sent to the United States Department of Agriculture lab for genotyping to see if these strains are related to other strains known to exist in that area. She recommended conducting additional public outreach in these areas to try and convince owners to remove their trees.

## **Strategic Priority 2 – Control ACP movement and Enforce Regulations**

### **Regulatory Activity Update**

Nawal Sharma stated that one year of data has been captured showing how bulk citrus is moved between ACP regional quarantine zones and into San Joaquin Valley, what mitigation measures are being used, and data on the pilot program. He noted that in April 2019, California Citrus Mutual (CCM), CRB and NST held meetings with growers, packers and haulers on HLB, including the impact of packing and moving shipments inside an HLB quarantine area. He explained that when moving bulk citrus between zones, 35 percent of bins were field cleaned, 62 percent were treated with a pre-harvest pesticide application prior to movement and three percent received no mitigation. He noted that Monterey County was the moved the largest amount of citrus out of a regional quarantine zone overall, followed by Tulare, San Luis Obispo, and Orange counties. He explained that 96 percent of Monterey bulk citrus shipped to Ventura County and four percent to San Joaquin Valley, whereas 72 percent of San Luis Obispo bulk citrus shipped to San Joaquin Valley. He stated 48 percent of bulk citrus shipped to San Joaquin Valley comes from Regional Quarantine Zone 3, primarily San Luis Obispo; 23 percent comes from Regional Quarantine Zone 4, primarily Ventura; 17 percent comes from Regional Quarantine Zone 5, Imperial, Riverside and San Diego counties; 12 percent comes from Orange County in Regional Quarantine Zone 6. Victoria noted that this data is gathered from the counties via the ACP-free Declaration form at destination.

Nawal stated that CDFA has been monitoring use of field-cleaning grates. The Operations Subcommittee recommended the pilot project go forward as a performance standard with a maximum of ten leaves per bin. Nawal stated that the counties inspect packing houses and there should be a spot inspection on each shipment. It was stated that the ACP Alternative Mitigation Pilot Project includes four participants: two growers shipping from Monterey to Ventura, one grower shipping from San Diego to Fresno and Kern, and one packinghouse shipping from Ventura and Kern to Riverside. It was suggested that a checkbox be included on the paperwork for whether ACP are sighted.

**Motion:** To approve an infield grate-cleaning option for the Asian citrus psyllid free performance standard. The protocol for the grate-cleaning option will include a procedure for CDFA and County Agricultural Commissioner approval of the device, a ten-leaf maximum per bin for plant material and a clear definition of what constitutes plant material.

First: Keith Watkins

Second: Roger Smith

Motion passes: All in favor

## **Strategic Priority 3 – ACP Control/Suppression**

### **Regional ACP Management**

Bob Atkins stated that the new Ventura County Agricultural Commissioner has sent out letters and begun to remove neglected and abandoned orchards per the California Food and Agriculture Code. He stated that there will be a combined EDT/Vectored Diseases meeting on May 9, 2019 with discussion on vectored diseases, and a presentation by Neil McRoberts on EDT research projects. He noted that the PCDs are operating well, with the new San Diego PCD approaching 90 percent participation in area-wide treatments.

### **Biocontrol Update**

David Morgan stated that 1,000,000 Tamarixia have been released in 2019, well ahead of previous years' releases. Biocontrol releases have totaled 13,000,000 since 2011. He explained that the biocontrol program is concentrating agent releases in a buffer around HLB areas. He noted that constant releases drive down ACP numbers around the HLB find sites. He stated that the program released agents in San Luis Obispo in March, San Jose, Santa Barbara and Kern County in April and Tulare in May. He intends to release biocontrol agents in Monterey and is working with the Monterey County Agricultural Commissioner to schedule the releases. He noted that the University of California Riverside (UCR) has been providing insects to release in Arizona on the California border which will be refunded by CRB.

### **Central Valley Update**

Cassandra Davis stated that most 2019 grove samples have been collected in the counties of Imperial, Orange, Riverside, San Bernardino, San Diego, Santa Barbara and Ventura. She explained that all Northern California counties with ACP delimitations have been added to the report. Contra Costa, Marin, Sacramento, San Francisco and Santa Clara have been tracked and added to ACP trap numbers. She noted that Contra Costa delimitations are county-run, while the other counties are state-run. She stated that Contra Costa, Monterey, Sacramento, San Francisco, San Luis Obispo, San Mateo, Santa Clara, and Tulare counties have had ACP finds in 2019.

Cassandra explained that Bob Luna is still working with Monterey County to try and get all the treatment refusals in Soledad to allow treatment. She stated that Bob is putting together a resurvey plan for some of the areas that were under-treated. The number of traps has gone down in the City of Bakersfield, but there is still good coverage. Victoria noted that Cassandra and Colleen performed an analysis that streamlined the trapping process which can be applied to the survey process through the Operations Subcommittee.

## **SCIENCE COMMITTEE REPORT**

### **Strategic Priority 4 – Improve Data Technology, Analysis and Sharing**

#### **Status of EDTs in California**

Dr. Melinda Klein stated that CRB has supported EDTs focused on larger-scale greenhouse trials and field trials. Results from three of those trials will be discussed on May 9, 2019, along with the next steps for the EDT Task Force in general. She stated that the canine HLB detector teams visited UCR and Lindcove in March and alerted on a number of trees. The UCR researchers have been testing the trees to see if they are positive via polymerase chain reaction.

### **Detector Dog Teams**

Lisa Finke stated her team will submit a Multi-agency Coordination (MAC) proposal for June 1, 2019 to commercialize the dogs in California. She stated the team is bringing six dogs and noted issues with maintaining and training in the Riverside quarantine zone. She stated that a design for a training center will be submitted to CDFA for a special permit. She explained that it would require 2x10 tree grids and live HLB material to train the dogs on. She noted Rick Dunn worked with her to develop a harness GPS coordinate within one foot of accuracy. Information from the belt or forearm-mounted software and collection system will be sent to the CRB database, she believes this will help with transparency. She noted that the cost of this system is \$3,500 and will not need to be duplicated for each dog. The data may not be able to be collected by one person.

### **HLB in Residential Areas and Future Action**

Etienne stated that there will come a point where we will be so overwhelmed with HLB+ trees in Southern California that it will become difficult to keep track, increasingly expensive to remove, and when we remove a PCR tree there are 9 others that are infectious but not symptomatic. He mentioned that he intends to ask DATOC to determine what are the barriers to go over to get to a point where we are not ineffective, he wants DATOC to determine the point of inefficiency in combating HLB. It was suggested that epidemiologists have been considering this issue for some time and will be needed to determine the tipping point. Etienne explained that tree removal must be paired with vector control. Etienne added that Ethyl formate is on track to be approved prior to Winter 2020.

## **OUTREACH COMMITTEE REPORT**

### **Strategic Priority 5 – Outreach and Education**

#### **General Outreach Update**

Mark McBroom stated that the Outreach Subcommittee discussed NST moving forward to update growers and those on the email blast from a grower liaison perspective. Price Adams stated that NST secured 218 unpaid news stories and over 358,800 social media impressions. She noted that NST secured more news stories in Northern California, but Southern Californian news stories received more impressions. The Citrus Insider stories with the highest open and click through rates, included ACP detections in Northern California and the announcement of the increase of HLB detections in 2018. She stated that the first Citrus Pest and Disease Prevention Program (CPDPP) annual report was mailed to 2,500 growers and shared on Citrus Insider. NST secured engagements at CCM Showcase, World Agriculture Expo and the California Association of Pest Control

Advisers Spring Summit. She noted that Aaron Dillon educated 60 Lowe's garden managers across the state and Mike Kulis held meetings with elected officials of Glendora, San Dimas, Claremont, Arcadia, Irvine, Azusa, Newport Beach and Bradbury. NST held HLB industry meetings in April, covering the science of ACP/HLB and regulatory responses. She explained that public service announcements, podcasts, movie theater ads, billboards, CDFA ride-alongs and recommended voluntary grower action plans are being developed.

### **CCM Report**

Casey Creamer stated that CCM got a specialty crop block grant for tree removals in the HLB core area. He stated CCM has started working with NST to do outreach in Westminster and will hold a workshop on June 1, 2019. He noted that there is emergency effort legislation to fix the farm bill funding specific for citrus. He stated that the Assembly and Senate have accepted the budget change proposal as-is, which includes \$5,000,000 for the Citrus program. A member request to increase funding has been received, which will go to the joint conference committee. He stated that the California Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) has begun banning the active ingredient Chlorpyrifos and will go through a two-year process of removing it. Meanwhile, the interim guidelines put in place in January will hold. The EPA has allocated \$5,700,000 to put together a stakeholder group to investigate alternatives.

### **CRB Report**

Franco Bernardi stated that 29 proposals went before the MAC committee, of which 12 were approved for a total of \$4,566,000. He noted that the MAC will be accepting proposals for the next round of funding on June 1, 2019. CRB produced the International Research Conference for HLB and the International Organization for Citrus Virologists in March. CRB held a Post-Harvest Conference in Santa Barbara. He stated that the research staff is processing 58 proposals for next year, with 32 moved forward. 78 percent of the new proposals were HLB-related. He stated that there are grower seminars in Palm Desert on June 25, Santa Barbara on June 26 and Exeter on June 27.

### **Closing Comments and Adjournment**

Jim Gorden adjourned the meeting at 3:06 p.m. The next CPDPC meeting will be held in Visalia, California on July 10, 2019 at 10:00 a.m.